



**SHARK ANGLING CLUB OF GREAT BRITAIN
COMMITTEE MEETING
HELD ON 11th December 2019 AT 7pm
(Postponed from 25th November 19)
AT THE LOOE SOCIAL CLUB**

Present: B Woodman - Chairman, C Kelly - Secretary, M Collings, P Davis, K Tapper, A McKay, P Martin (via Phone link)

Apologies: D Stone, S Ward, S Thomas,

Minutes of last meeting: Approval proposed by P Davis and seconded by M Collings.

Matters Arising

1. Angling Trust Meeting Update – K Tapper stated that David Mitchel had requested a precis of the SACGB, which had been provided, after approval by the Chairman. This will be available to view in an upcoming publication from the Angling Trust.
2. Best Practice Document update – K Tapper is still working on the updates.
3. Festival 2020 Update – A letter had been received from Lee from Silver Sea Charters stating his interest in being a Skipper in next year's Festival. His name to be put on a waiting list. The secretary updated the Committee with the bookings for the 2020 Festival. 44 people are confirmed and have paid deposits. 13 boats had already expressed an interest in being a part of the festival. The remaining angler places will now be opened up to associate members.
4. Lucky Run Club Draw – The Chairman drew the winner of the Lucky Run Club, Novembers prize was £60.00. The winner was: D J Smith
December's prize was £60.00. The winner was: A McKay

Correspondence

- Valuation of Trophies – The secretary advised that all of the trophies had now been valued and a printed record received. The trophies 'replacement value' total was £45,000. Currently the Club's insurance only covered £37,000. The secretary to inform the insurers of the new figure. The level of cover of insurance, regarding trophies being handed out to members and kept at their properties, to be checked.
- Jon Read - emails – The secretary read the following email from Jon Read:

Clare

It's now been a month since my follow up email and I still have had no response from the club. I would also like to ask why, at the Dinner, there was no mention of Sam Narbett's feat of putting his anglers on 2 world record fish in 1 day that were safely brought to the boat and unhooked. A member of the committee was present on that day and celebration was made that Dan Margetts caught 1 of the fish. The club is supposed to be promoting the sport but I feel that this wasn't mentioned as Sam has the audacity to live and work in St Ives.

I stood down from the committee as I felt that the club was turning inwards to once again become the Shark Angling Club of Looe and the annual dinner and trophy awards only reinforces this.

Regards

Jon



The secretary stated that a reply, discussed at the last meeting, and approved by the Committee had now been sent to Mr Read.

The Committee then discussed Mr Read's comments regarding Sam Narbett.

M Collings stated that the skipper did not want any publicity regarding the catches as the topic was (and still is) controversial. The skipper's wishes were respected.

There were also no claims submitted for the catches, for the same reason.

The following, further, email received from Jon Read was then read out:

Clare

Thank you for having been involved in my trying to get answers from the committee - I appreciate your help. Following on from your email this morning I would be grateful if you could put this email in front of the committee at the next meeting so it is properly minuted and my views and the committee's response are then available for perusal by all members. The points I have to make reflect my personal frustrations at the way the club appears to be being driven into irrelevance by the committee and are not personal attacks.

I asked the question: *The website update of 2 August stated "The club have also taken the decision to introduce an immediate, and indefinite suspension period for all trophy and British Measured & Released Records claims for Porbeagle sharks." so how does this tie in with the award of trophies at this year's Annual Dinner of which 6 are being awarded for porbeagle sharks?*

The committee's response is:

The Sammy Porbeagle Trophy, for the 'Best Porbeagle Shark of the Season', has been suspended. This has been done so that anglers are not encouraged or rewarded for the fishing of Porbeagles.

My response is:

Please answer my question as to why six trophies were awarded for porbeagle sharks rather than telling me that one trophy has been suspended. I, and other members, want to know how these trophies can be awarded after the club's statement of 2 August.

I asked the question: *I was under the belief that the Mitchell Hedges was awarded for the best shark which was measured and released. No disrespect to Alex as his was a fine fish but all of the posts on Facebook relating to this shark stated that it was estimated as they couldn't measure it. Surely the Mitchell Hedges should be awarded to Harvey O'Malley?*

The committee's response is:

In the case of a shark being too large to boat safely and enough video/photo evidence - the committee have the power to award certain trophies to un-boated fish (for the welfare of fish and safety of anglers/people on board the vessel) as they see fit and acceptable. Something that is being encouraged with all big sharks. All decisions are at the Committee's discretion

My response is:

The statement above is all well and good but does not explain why the trophy for the best fish was awarded to Alex it merely says that decisions are at the committee's discretion. What were the factors behind the committee's decision?

I asked the question:

the Iris Memorial trophy is supposed to be for "The biggest shark caught, measured and released..." these are the words on the website and how the trophy is defined

The committee's response is:

The Thresher Shark caught by Alex McKay was measured as well as possible, it was obviously a large fish and the angler and skipper wished to put no further distress upon the fish by trying to board it. After viewing video evidence and hearing witness testimonies the Committee accepted this claim as an 'estimated' weight of a shark that was caught, measured in the water and released. They feel that this is the way forward for the club.

My response is:

The thresher shark was not measured at all and its is disingenuous of the committee to try and suggest otherwise. There are other trophies for estimated fish but when a trophy is



specifically for a measured fish it should not be awarded for an estimated fish. Where is the video evidence which would show an attempt to measure the fish? Furthermore the fish has now grown and is being described in Saltwater Boat Angling as now being 14' long and between 600 and 800lbs. This highlights how accurate any attempts at measurement were. A few weeks ago a 13' thresher was caught in nets and weighed at Plymouth. This weight was 396lbs which is considerably smaller than the "measured as well as possible" 13' thresher caught by Alex.

I asked the question:

why is Dan Margett's shark not winning the March trophy. This was caught on 29 March out from St Ives and I was present that day (see Sam Narbett (Bluefin Charters)'s post of 26 September)

The committee's response is:

Dan joined as a Full Member, after March, on the 10th June 2019. Dan was awarded the R C Roberts Trophy for 'the best qualifying shark of the season' at this time. No claim declaration was received by Dan therefore he was not considered for 'Fish of the Month'. The Committee have decided to award the trophy to Dan, but in future no Trophies will be issued without a Claim Declaration Form being submitted.

My response is:

The answer forgot to mention the Mustad Trophy but it is encouraging to know that the committee is happy to award trophies to anyone whether they submit a claim form or not and therefore go against the revised rules and procedures which were agreed in 2018.

I asked the question:

why, at the Dinner, there was no mention of Sam Narbett's feat of putting his anglers on 2 world record fish in 1 day that were safely brought to the boat and unhooked. A member of the committee was present on that day and celebration was made that Dan Margetts caught 1 of the fish. The club is supposed to be promoting the sport but I feel that this wasn't mentioned as Sam has the audacity to live and work in St Ives.

The committee has not responded to this.

I look forward to the committee's proper response to all of my outstanding points and humbly suggest that when the 2020 trophies are being awarded that the committee members properly study and think about the conflicts of interest clause in the rules and regulations. Conflict of interest does not have to be purely financial.

Regards

Jon

- D O'Malley Emails – The secretary read the following email from D O'Malley;

Hi Claire

I'd like to start by saying what a great night we had on Saturday at the presentation and thought it went very well and was really well organised .

I did however have several members ask why Harvey had not been awarded the Mitchell Hedges Trophy and the IRIS memorial Trophy as he had caught the largest Boated, Measured and Released shark of the season. (IRIS memorial even states for the Biggest caught measured and released)

Having read through the SACGB website (and attached and highlighted a section of it) it states The Trophies are for sharks brought aboard, measured & released . The Thresher caught by Alex was a magnificent fish and massive achievement for angler and skipper but as far as i know was visually estimated and not boarded or measured, there is however another category specifically for this that was brought in last year (also highlighted) for sharks that are too big to bring aboard or for safety reasons , this rightly was awarded for the same fish .

The Mitchell-Hedges and Iris Memorial are prestigious trophies that are not easy to win , i and some other members feel these have been mis-awarded as a visually estimated shark does not meet the criteria, there is also no mention of an "at the committees discretion " clause in the trophy section apart from the "visually estimated shark " category so i believe these trophies are for boated shark only.

I felt Saturday was not the right time to discuss this matter as i did not want to spoil the night but Could i please have some clarity from the committee on the above please .

I look forward to your reply.

Many thanks

Danny O'Malley



A second email was read out from D O'Malley;

Hi Claire

When is the meeting rescheduled for please, and can this email also be read out along with my last one please?

On the other reply to the Iris Memorial trophy, there appears to be some confusion .If the shark for whatever reason is not boarded it then goes into the visually estimated trophy category , not wanting to board it if it is too big or for the safety of shark or angler are actually listed as reasons for the visual trophies.

The Mitchell Hedges trophy is for Best Shark, Best shark is the one with the most total points, these are for the length of shark and girth, as the thresher was not measured with a tape and just visually , it cannot be considered for this trophy .

Many thanks

Danny

K Tapper stated that he had spoken to D O'Malley that afternoon regarding the Iris Memorial Trophy. Mr Tapper had spoken to D Stone (who donated the Iris Memorial Trophy) and Mr Stone was happy that it had been awarded for a shark caught, measured and released.

Mr O'Malley's point was that the Mitchell Hedges Trophy was for 'Best Shark which has the most total points' and points are gained by measuring the length and girth to gain points, which had not been done.

A discussion took place.

It was agreed that a reply would be drafted to Mr O'Malley for approval by the Committee. A copy to be published in the Minutes of the Monthly Meeting of January.

Any Other Business

- Dates for 2020 Meetings issued to the Committee.
- Date of 24/10/20 approved for the Trophy Presentation Night. Portbyhan approved.
- A McKay – returned his trophies for storage due to an imminent house move.
- K Tapper had received a reply from Matt Witt, who was interested in tagging studies via Exeter University, and he would like to meet with the Committee. K Tapper to arrange.

The meeting closed at 7.45pm.

Date of Next Meeting – 27th January 2020 at 7pm